

THE COCHISE QUARTERLY

Volume 1

Number 1

March, 1971



Cochise College
Learning Resources Center

CONTENTS

The Life and Times of Wyatt Earp by John W. Gilchriese	3
Casas Grandes Water Control System by Charles C. Di Peso	7
Prelude to the Battle of Cibicu by John H. Monnett	12
The Salado Culture in Cochise County by Jack P. and Vera M. Mills	28

Cover designed by
Ray Levra, Cochise College



A Publication of the Cochise County Historical and
Archaeological Society
P. O. Box 207
Pearce, Arizona 85625

THE LIFE AND TIMES OF WYATT EARP

by John D. Gilchriese

Field Historian, University of Arizona

On March 19, 1848 a seemingly unimportant event took place in Monmouth, Warren County, Illinois. Although nearly totally unnoticed at the time, the birth of Wyatt Berry Stapp Earp would prove significant to countless individuals interested in the history of the post Civil War, trans-Mississippi West. His name has become commonplace to serious historians and an army of fictioneers alike. Yet, history shows that this man spent little actual time in Monmouth. Just two years after his birth, the Earp family migrated to Pella, in southeastern Iowa. On the beautiful rolling prairies surrounding this small agricultural town, Wyatt Earp grew to manhood.

Due to the rigid insistence of his father, Nicholas Porter Earp, Wyatt, his brothers and sisters received a two-fold education. For the sons this included not only classroom studies, but a knowledge of several trades as well. Farm work, however, never appealed to Wyatt who as a small boy craved the more adventurous pursuits of hunting and exploring the local Iowa countryside. With the Civil War beginning its last great campaigns in mid-1864, the Earps joined a wagon train for an overland move to California. In this journey, Wyatt, for the first time, encountered the Wild West that would later be so inexorably linked with his name. In December, 1864 the Earp clan arrived in San Bernardino, California.

Since the challenge of adventure had become so entrenched in Wyatt's character rather early in life, he joined a freighting outfit soon after reaching the Golden State. His resulting journeys included the hauling of supplies to such remote frontier settlements as the Mormon capital of Salt Lake City and the fledgling town of Prescott, in the Arizona Territory. In 1868, Nicholas Earp moved his family from southern California north to Wyoming. Wyatt went along and together with his older brother, Virgil, soon found work with the Union Pacific Railroad during that company's frenzied drive to link-up with the west coast's Central Pacific Railroad at Promintory Summit, Utah.

The year of the transcontinental railroad's completion, 1869, also saw Wyatt briefly return to his birthplace. But after experiencing the wild frontiers of California, Utah, Wyoming and Arizona, Warren County offered no inducement to a man like Wyatt Earp. He soon left Monmouth and rejoined his family; then living in Lamar, Barton County, Missouri. In 1870 Wyatt won the election as town constable. Thus, at the age of twenty-two, Wyatt Earp began his experience as a frontier peace officer. That same year he also married the first of his three wives, only to see her die within a year. Wyatt's young bride left him many pleasant but sad memories.

Soon after the death of his wife, Wyatt Earp joined a surveying party traveling west into the Indian Nations; present-day Oklahoma. He accepted his position with alacrity. The Great Plains offered a

wide assortment of game; buffalo, elk, wild turkey, ducks, geese and other animals. Perhaps nowhere else on the continent did there exist such a profusion of wild life. Since part of Wyatt's duties included the supplying of fresh meat to the survey party, this experience eventually led him into the ranks of the buffalo hunter; a move taken by many of his contemporaries. The professional buffalo hunter, who enjoyed a brief period of importance on the plains, had to be by necessity a frontiersman of some merit, skilled with the use of firearms and, since he intruded upon Indian land, an Indian fighter. Here Wyatt Earp witnessed the sudden, brutal and savage warfare waged by the Indian in the defense of his homeland.

The driving of Texas cattle up the Chisholm and later the Western Trail, to the mushrooming Kansas cowtowns, became one of the great phenomenons in western history. Wyatt Earp commented often during his long life that he had always wanted to become successful in the range cattle business. Residing at Wichita, Kansas in 1873, he came to the conclusion that rampant lawlessness would eventually destroy the trail drives and render the cowtowns unfit for decent citizens. He took the logical step and became a peace officer. Wild and wicked Wichita, burdened with hordes of young and sometimes dangerous Texas cowboys, gunmen, frontier gamblers, buffalo hunters and Indian fighters, presented monumental problems to the city marshal's office. Yet here, in this frontier cauldron, Wyatt's reputation as a resolute and dangerous adversary, with either fist or gun, became a reality. Potential lawbreakers quickly discovered they could not trifle with the slender, muscular, police officer named Wyatt Earp. While in Wichita, Wyatt also became acquainted with a host of now famous western personalities; Ben Thompson, Luke Short, Billy Tilghman, Neil Brown and Bat Masterson.

By the mid-1870's Dodge City took the play away from Wichita as the major shipping point for Texas cattle. Wyatt arrived in Dodge in May, 1876 and assumed the position of policeman. While in Dodge City he made enemies that would plague him later in Arizona. In 1878 Earp's friend from Wichita days, Bat Masterson, became the Sheriff of Ford County, with Dodge City its seat of government. The association between these two men grew into a close friendship. The low pay coupled with the trials and tribulations of law enforcement in Dodge convinced Wyatt that he must seek an occupation with a larger income if he wished to realize his persistent dream of owning his own cattle ranch.

In 1879 Wyatt heard from his brother Virgil, living in Prescott; about the possibilities of mining speculation in Arizona; particularly the new silver camp of Tombstone, located in the southeastern corner of the territory. So in the fall of 1879 Wyatt Earp resigned as the assistant marshal of Dodge City, Kansas and together with his second wife, Matilda, headed for Prescott. By setting a slow pace with numerous stops along the way, particularly in New Mexico, Wyatt's entourage (by then including Doc Holliday and his wife) arrived by November at the home of his brother. A veteran of the Civil War and many a cowtown and mining camp, Virgil W. Earp

and his wife joined Wyatt's party and together they traveled south to Tucson, the "Old Pueblo."

On November 27, 1879 Virgil received an appointment as deputy U. S. marshal for southern Arizona. Several months later Pima County Sheriff Charles Shibell would appoint Wyatt Earp his deputy with jurisdiction in the Tombstone mining district (Cochise County had yet to be created). The Earps arrived in Tombstone on December 1, 1879. At that time it was a small dusty village perched on a wind-swept plateau some seventy-two miles southeast of Tucson. Yet uproarous Tombstone soon became the largest community between El Paso, Texas and San Francisco.

For the Earps, this sun-drenched town in southeastern Arizona would prove a battle ground that tried their patience on more than one occasion. Wyatt Earp's first contact with the active outlaw element came in October, 1880 when he arrested Curley Bill Brocius for accidentally killing town marshal Fred White. Although Curley Bill later gained his freedom in court, this incident initiated a series of events that kept the Earp brothers in a state of constant turmoil. They had become locked in a struggle of supremacy with a dedicated and ruthless band of outlaws which terrorized the countryside at will.

No greater host of frontier characters ever assembled in one location as those who walked the streets of Tombstone in the early 1880's; the Earps, Doc Holliday, John Ringo, the Clantons, the McLaury brothers, Buckskin Frank Leslie, John Behan, Luke Short, Frank Stilwell, Curley Bill, Bat Masterson and many other names now famous throughout the world.

The West's most celebrated gunfight took place in Tombstone on October 26, 1881 in a vacant lot adjacent to the O.K. Corral's rear entrance on Fremont street. This battle, near the corner of Third and Fremont, catapulted the Earp brothers into western immortality. Fictional versions of this fight have been told and re-told by Hollywood writers and pulp authors alike. Due to this approach the event itself still remains one of the most controversial and misunderstood in western history.

When Tombstone City Marshal Virgil Earp gathered his brothers, Wyatt and Morgan, together with Doc Holliday, little did he realize that the results would become such a "cause celebre." Walking west along Fremont street, past the rear entrance to the O.K. Corral, they entered a small vacant lot just beyond C. S. Fly's photograph gallery and shielded from Third street by a wooden frame building on the southeast corner. In this small space they faced Ike and Billy Clanton, Tom and Frank McLaury, Billy Claiborne and Wesley Fuller. Virgil ordered them to surrender their arms and throw up their hands; they refused to do either. Frank McLaury and Wyatt Earp fired the first shots. Unlike McLaury, Wyatt did not miss. The fight lasted only half a minute claiming the lives of the McLaury brothers and William Clanton. Ike Clanton, Clairborne and Wesley Fuller had deserted their companions and fled the scene. Although not fatal, Virgil and Morgan Earp received

painful wounds. After a lengthy trial for murder, the court exonerated the Earps and Doc Holliday by ruling they had done their duty in defense of Tombstone's city ordinances.

On the evening of December 28, 1881 a group of concealed assassins attempted to murder Virgil Earp as he crossed the intersection of Fifth and Allen streets. Shotgun blasts shattered his left arm and left it nearly useless. In mid-march, 1882 the assassins struck again, this time with fatal success. They killed Morgan Earp while he played pool at the rear of Campbell and Hatch's saloon. Wyatt, realizing that foul play would see each of the Earps assassinated in turn, retaliated by killing Frank Stilwell, one of Morgan's murderers, when he found the accused stage robber and former Cochise County deputy sheriff in the Tucson train yard.

Wyatt Earp, leaving Tombstone with Doc Holliday and several friends, rode westward to the Whetstone Mountains. There he found Curley Bill encamped with a group of his fellow border outcasts. In a duel to the death, Wyatt Earp ended the outlaw leader's career. Earp and his party then rode out of the Arizona Territory and into the mountain fastness of southern Colorado. Yet, in another sense, he also rode into popular legend.

From Colorado to Utah and then to California, for a brief visit in San Francisco, Wyatt Earp continued his lonely odyssey over the face of the American West. Determined to make the fortune thus far denied him, Wyatt went to Los Angeles and from there to San Diego. In San Diego he invested heavily in property and realized a sizeable fortune. The year 1890 found him once again in San Francisco; racing horses at local tracks, as well as, in 1896, refereeing the controversial prize fight between Tom Sharkey and Bob Fitzsimmons. The following year he joined the great Alaskan gold rush—visiting Wrangel, Dyea and Rampart. In 1899 he arrived in Nome and stayed there until 1901 before returning to southern California.

From Los Angeles he traveled overland to Tonopah, Nevada and registered several mining claims in the area. In 1905, after once again outfitting in Los Angeles, he traveled over the Mojave Desert to the Colorado River country. South of Needles, California, Wyatt located a series of gold mines that would demand his attention until his death. Spending the winters in the Whipple Mountains and the summers in Los Angeles and San Francisco, the Indian summer of his life passed quickly.

On a foggy Sunday morning, January 13, 1929, Wyatt Berry Stapp Earp died in Los Angeles after a long illness and passed into history. He had finally departed the West that he knew and loved so well. His many contributions to his own era have been grossly misunderstood. Yet, Wyatt himself said many times; "As a peace officer I did my duty and I would not change it if I had it to do all over again."

His fame in the years since 1929 has spread to all parts of the world. The name Wyatt Earp is now firmly identified as one of the West's most interesting and controversial personalities.

Copyrighted by John D. Gilchriese, 1971.

CASAS GRANDES WATER CONTROL SYSTEM

By Charles C. Di Peso

Director, The Amerind Foundation, Inc.

The combination of those features defined by Wittfogel (1967: 30-61) as part of his model of a compact simple or semi-complex Mesoamerican hydraulic system were present at Casas Grandes during its Medio Period. These included such productive hydraulic installations as canals, aqueducts, reservoirs, and sluices, as well as specific up-slope protective devices as check dams and terraces. Apparently, this entire socio-economic mechanism was brought north to Paquime in the mid-11th Century by a few donor traders of **puchteca**, as described by Sahagun (Dibble and Anderson, 1959). These folk, in a span of a few years, thrust an urban economy of social and environmental exploitation upon the backward, indigenous groups of soil members and parasites. This frontier culture conquest situation (Foster, 1960: 10-20) created a local hybrid horizon which, during its pioneer phase, was extremely virile and responsive to the necessity of adopting new food chains to serve its expanding needs. Through the course of 300 years, hundreds of satellite farming communities sprang up in the bottomlands to support the growing urban population of the central city, which drew more and more people from the soil and set them to non-food producing tasks—as members of artisan guilds, or in various extracting and processing industries, domestic and foreign trade, and large construction works (Wittfogel, 1967: 243-47). In all probability, these leaders were members of the powerful religion of the plumed serpent (Quetzalcoatl). It is apparent that in this burst of economic energy, the population grew to fill the lush valley lands and then, at least by A.D. 1150 (Scott, 1966: 42 and 60), more satellite villages were built to the westward, up the mountain slopes, to the upper limit of agriculture which was frost-free for only three months of the year. Whoever controlled the people during this period of growth prevailed upon the indigenous labor pool—either by slavery, corvee contract, or a combination of both—to instigate a surface water-soil conservation system which proved to be an amazing piece of prehistoric engineering. Many students, such as Bandelier (1892), Lumholtz (1902, Vol. 1), Leopold (1937 and 1949), Brand (1943), Withers (1963), and Herold (1965), as well as Howard and Griffiths (1966), have remarked on this, and some, such as Herold (1915), Withers (1963), and Luebben (1969), have intimately studied portions of the elaborate protective aspects in the Casas Grandes Archaeological Zone, which Wittfogel (in Thomas, 1956: 159-60 and 1967: 3, 24-25) would define as a required part of his hydraulic model.

Archaeological reconnaissance has revealed that pre-Hispanic mountain-slope agriculture was practiced, wherever feasible, in conjunction with a conservation program which involved five mountainous areas. All of these contained evidence of the presence of Casas Grandes material culture and were thought of as a homogeneous archaeological zone. Two—the Santa Maria and the Carmen

valleys—parallel and lie east of the Casas Grandes heartland. These have different watersheds, which, as yet, have not been intensively studied, and therefore were not considered in this paper. Surveys to the west of Paquime revealed that protective devices were placed in two watersheds west of the continental divide, as well as in the Casas Grandes drainage on the east slopes of the Sierra Madre. The former two are part of the great Yaqui river system. One included the headwaters of the Bavispe of the East, which drained the mountains north of the Las Cuevas district, herein referred to as the Tres Rios area. This other lies to the south and emptied into the Papogochic, and is called the Garabato-Chico. Together these three mountain regions cover some 23,000 sq. km. and extend north from the 29° 40' north latitude to the international border, a distance of 230 km., and 100 km. east of the 108° 55' west longitude, or roughly from Nacori Chico, in Sonora, to the eastern flanks of the Sierra Madre, in Chihuahua. The Casas Grandes shed includes a little better than half of this entire area, or some 12,000 sq. km. of land. This part of the drainage was modified to safeguard some 80,000 hectares of rich bottomland.

The following data, pertaining to the upslope terrace or trinchera stone devices, were collected by Herold (1965), mainly from the Rio Gavilan portion of the area, lying west of the divide, but can be applied in general to the Casas Grandes drainage as well. The pre-Spanish engineers first placed linear borders on the "top-of-the-mountain" terrain (Woodbury, 1961: 12-13 and Herold, 1965: 106-07) in elevations between 1,524 m. and 2,438 m. above M.S.L. These simple, single to three-tiered stone rows followed the natural contours of the land and were placed on slopes which dropped at an angle of 1° to 3°. They were irregularly set from 6.10 m. to 65.85 m. These plain devices so slowed down the periodic torrential surface runoffs that the disastrous effect of sheet flooding, which tends to eradicate the mountain soils, was minimized.

On lower slopes, which dipped from 3° to 10°, the engineers strategically-placed series of terraces. These were more substantial than linear borders, but they too paralleled the natural contours. These were purposefully built as hillside steps and varied from .61 m. to 1.22 m. in height. They were constructed anywhere from 6.10 m. to 30.35 m. apart, dependent upon the angle of the slope and the height of the retaining walls which were designed not only to slow the surface water runoff, but also to collect mantle by the simple expediency of natural deposition caused by checking—rather than by impounding—water flow.

On the steeper portions of the upslope areas, in arroyo cuts with gradients of up to 30°, the people of Paquime placed check dams—another type of stone retaining walls which were not unlike the slope terraces, but ran at right angles to the arroyo bed. These devices made up some 84% of the total system (Herold, 1965: 103) and varied tremendously in number, dependent on the length and grade of the arroyo cut. They ranged in height from .09 m. to 3.75 m. and were so set that the top of one was level with the base of the next upslope wall. Soil was naturally deposited behind these walls,

and, as a consequence, they often had to be raised. Conceivably, the check dams could be built up to the point where they would completely fill their arroyos (Ibid: 119-22, fig. 18), as has been noted farther south in Mexico (Sanders, 1965: 43) Often, these check dams were staggered to force the rainwater to run down slope in a zigzag course, thus slowing it further (Withers, 1963).

In the permanent flow of the upslope areas, the prehistoric hydrographers—imitating the beaver—placed riverside terraces (Ibid, and Herold, 1965: 109, pls. 11-12) or dams across the main arteries. These were found to measure from 3.05 m. to 12.19 m. in length and were spaced from 18.29 m. to 62.48 m. apart.

This system and its parts were repeated wherever necessary to control the violence of the thunderstorms throughout the down slope portions of the valley until the waters reached the rich bottomlands. Here a series of irrigation canals were built, crisscrossing the valley, thus permitting widespread hydraulic farming. The entire system was so effective that the people fearlessly founded a number of their satellite farming villages on the valley flood plain.

There is increasing evidence that linear and grid borders, check dams, and terraces were used by a number of prehistoric occupants of the southwestern portion of the United States (Woodbury, 1961: 35-34). In this area, they have been termed "agricultural field systems" (Ibid: 8-34) because of their limited extent and scattered geographical distribution. These, because of their localized character, should not be confused with the expensive regional design of Casas Grandes, as has been done by Howard and Griffiths (1966: 81). Withers (1963) recorded that, "it is generally conceded by contemporary inhabitants and users of 'the mountain' that these dams are the principal conservation force holding the mountain together today."

All in all, the archeological evidence indicates that the soil exploiters of Casas Grandes, in the words of Leopold (1949: 150) were "capable of inhabiting a river without disrupting the harmony of its life."

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Almanda, Francisco R.

1945 **Geografía del Estado de Chihuahua.** Impresor Ruiz Sandoval. Chihuahua.

Bandelier, A. F.

1892 **Final Report of Investigations Among the Indians of the Southwestern United States Carried on Mainly in the Years from 1880 to 1885. Papers of the Archaeological Institute of America, American Series IV.** Cambridge.

Brand, Donald D.

1943 **The Chihuahua Culture Area. New Mexico Anthropologist, Vol. 6-7, No. 3, pp. 115-58.** Albuquerque.

Dibble, Charles E. and Arthur J. O. Anderson,
Editors and Translators.

- 1959 *Historia general de Las Cosas de Nueva Espana*, Book 9—The Merchants. In **Forentine Codex**, edited and translated by Charles E. Dibble and Arthur J. O. Anderson. The School of American Research and the University of Utah Monographs of The School of American Research. Santa Fe.

Di Peso, Charles C.

- 1968 Casas Grandes, A Fallen Trading Center of the Gran Chichimeca. **The Masterkey**, Vol. 42, No. 1, pp. 20-37. Los Angeles.
- 1968 Casas Grandes and the Gran Chichimeca. **El Palacio**, Vol. 75, No. 4, pp. 45-61. Santa Fe.

Foster, George M.

- 1960 *Culture and Conquest: America's Spanish Heritage*. **Viking Fund Publications in Anthropology**, No. 27. New York.

Hammond, George P. and Agapito Rey

- 1928 **Obregon's History of 16th Century Explorations in Western America**. Edited, translated, and annotated by George P. Hammond and Agapito Rey. Wetzel Publishing Company, Inc. Los Angeles.

Herold, Laurance C.

- 1965 *Trincheras and Physical Environment Along the Rio Gavilan, Chihuahua, Mexico*. **University of Denver Publications in Geography, Technical Paper**, No. 65-1. Denver.

Howard, William A. and Thomas M. Griffiths

- 1966 *Trinchera Distribution in the Sierra Madre Occidental, Mexico*. **University of Denver Publications in Geography, Technical Paper**, No. 66-1. Denver.

Leopold, Aldo

- 1937 *Conservationist in Mexico*. **American Forests**, Vol. 43, pp. 118-20.
- 1949 **A Sand Country Almanac and Sketches Here and There**. Oxford University Press. New York.

Luebben, Ralph A.

- 1969 *Whetten Pueblo and Its Relationship to Trincheras and Nearby Small Structures*. Manuscript. Grinnel College.

Lumholtz, Carl

- 1902 **Unknown Mexico, Vol. 1**. Charles Scribner's Sons. New York.

Sanders, William T.

- 1965 **The Cultural Ecology of the Teotihuacan Valley. A Preliminary Report of the Results of the Teotihuacan Valley Project, Department of Sociology and Anthropology. The Pennsylvania State University. University Park.**

Scott, Stuart D.

- 1966 **Dendrochronology in Mexico. Papers of the Laboratory of Tree-Ring Research, No. 2. University of Arizona Press. Tucson.**

Thomas, William L., Jr., Editor, with the collaboration of Carl O. Sauer, Marston Bates, and Lewis Mumford.

- 1956 **Man's Role in Changing the Face of the Earth. University of Chicago Press. Chicago.**

Withers, Arnold M.

- 1963 **A Survey of Check Dams and Archaeological Sites on the Albert Whetten Ranch, Chihuahua. Paper presented at the Thirty-Second Annual Meeting of the Society for American Archaeology. Boulder.**

Wittfogel, Karl A.

- 1967 **Oriental Despotism: A Comparative Study of Total Power. Yale University Press. New Haven and London.**

Woodbury, Richard B.

- 1961 **Prehistoric Agriculture at Point of Pines, Arizona. Memoirs of the Society for American Archaeology, No. 17. Salt Lake City.**

PRELUDE TO THE BATTLE OF CIBICU

by John H. Monnett

San Jose State College

The troopers of the United States Cavalry under the command of General Nelson A. Miles watched in silent tribute as the last long train of military wagons wound its way along the dust choked road, down the mountain from Fort Bowie, Arizona Territory, to the nearby railhead. The year was 1886 and the wagons were carrying Geronimo and all the remaining Chiricahua Apaches in Arizona to be loaded into waiting railroad cars like so many heads of cattle, and at long last shipped off to a Florida prison camp.

It was the end of more than fifty years of warfare between the Apache Indians and the United States. It marked the termination of one of the most colorful eras in Southwestern history.

It had been an exciting era—one compounded of action and heroism. It was the story of Tom Jeffords and the one-armed General O. O. Howard riding into the heart of Cochise's stronghold, deep in the crags of the Dragoon Mountains, to negotiate a lasting peace. It was the story of Lt. John Rucker trying to rescue another officer from a flooded canyon and dying in the attempt. It was the story of a determined General George Crook struggling to cover vast territory with a handful of men. It was the story of an embittered Geronimo fighting against hopeless odds. It was the story of a gallant Captain Crawford being killed by Mexican irregulars, deep in the Sierra Madre Mountains of old Mexico.

In Arizona Territory during the 1870's and 1880's a gallant group of Indians tried to stop the march of Western civilization. The soldiers and civilians who led that march were no less gallant. The bitter fighting that focused there forced the army to develop sophisticated guerilla warfare techniques, giving this long-ago history a pertinence to modern events that illustrates the adage: "The past is prologue to the future."¹

The story of their effort is but one small segment in the history of a long and bloody struggle. It is unique in that the circumstances and events surrounding it are strange and unmatched in the usual means by which the Apache people fought and attempted to halt the on-rushing tide of the white man. And yet, at the same time, it is fairly consistent with the actions and characteristics demonstrated by all civilizations throughout world history who have found their cultures outmoded and decayed. When all practical-logical methods of rescuing their way of life have failed, they acquire a code of ethics embodied in the mystic and supernatural as a last desperate measure of re-asserting themselves.

The circumstances which surround this hysteria of desperation befell the Apaches of the White Mountain Reservation in East-Central Arizona for a brief period in 1881. It is known as the Cibicu

1. National Historical Site Leaflet, (Fort Bowie, Arizona), No. 67-422, 1-2.

incident and includes the Battle of Cibicu fought on August 30, 1881. The important events leading to this battle deal with the Sixth United States Cavalry stationed at Fort Apache and the usually peaceful Apache scouts. These scouts were enlisted in the army's service and lived with many more of their kinsmen on the White Mountain Reservation.² At this time most of the Indians living on the reserve belonged to the White Mountain and Cibicu groups. Sometimes these groups are classified as one by scholars and simply named White Mountain Apaches.

Among the white men in the Arizona and New Mexico territories during the nineteenth century, the different bands of Apaches were often known by more than one name. History has been confused by this practice, but Greenville Goodwin in "Experiences of an Apache Scout" sets forth the following classification.³ Goodwin states:

"It must be understood that all Apaches were divided into groups or tribes, and that certain sets of these groups or tribes which were more or less alike in custom and speech, went to make up the several Apache divisions. Thus the Western Apache Division to which John Rope (an old White Mountain scout who was Goodwin's informant for this article) belonged was composed of five groups: White Mountain people, San Carlos people, Southern Tonto people and Northern Tonto people. The only other Apache division here mentioned is that of the Chiricahua and their two allied tribes, the Warm Springs people and the N-in-da-hi. Due to the often hostile feelings between this division and the Western Apache division, it was not hard to enlist the Western Apaches against the Chiricahuas and their two allied tribes. The Yavapais were a Yuman tribe, closely related to the Western Apaches in culture, who had been compelled to come and settle on the San Carlos Reservation . . . The third tribe of the Apache division to which Chiricahua and Warm Springs people belonged, the 'N-in-da-hi,' whose proper home was mainly in the north end of the Sierra Madre in Mexico, meant 'outlaw people' (The Western Apaches were known to the Chiricahua and their two allied tribes as 'Bi-ne-dine'), which meant 'brain-

2. For the most part these Apache Reservations were established in 1872 by Executive order and after the Civil War when once again people began moving West. The White Mountain and San Carlos Reservations, located in East-Central Arizona, and the Mescalero Reservation, located in South-Central New Mexico, were the principal ones then and remain so even today. There was one more, the Chiricahua Reservation located in South-Eastern Arizona, established in 1872 by agreement between Cochise and General O. O. Howard, with Thomas Jeffords as agent. However, in 1874 when John Clum became Agent in Arizona, he initiated a policy of concentrating all Apaches in western New Mexico and east and central Arizona on the San Carlos Reservation, thus abolishing the Chiricahua Reserve. This policy proved futile because it brought together various Apache groups who were traditionally hostile toward each other. Eventually this situation spawned further warfare.
3. Grenville Goodwin, "Experiences of an Apache Scout," *Arizona History Review*, Vol. II, No. 1, (Jan. 1936). p. 3.

less people' . . . The Western Apaches do not seem to resent it much."⁴

It was this confusion over the various Apache bands,⁵ plus the greed of white merchants, traders, miners and cattlemen, as well as political machines in Arizona, New Mexico and Washington, D.C., that ultimately created the bloody Frankenstein known today as the Apache troubles, including Cibicu.⁶

A central theme for the mystery which shrouded the circumstances at Cibicu Creek in 1881 seem fairly certain. In that year most of the Apache groups could not find leaders capable of achieving the hopes and aspirations commonly persistent in all Apache tribes. Specifically they needed a war leader, one who could unite them. They could not find one great enough in power and stature. The last chief that had met this criteria was the infamous Victorio.

For three years, 1879-1881, Victorio and his warriors left a trail of blood across Arizona, western New Mexico and west Texas that is virtually unmatched in the long history of Apache warfare against the white man. During this period he fought and eluded soldiers of the 9th U. S. Cavalry, citizens of three states, and soldiers and citizens of Sonora and Chihuahua in Old Mexico. Finally in August, 1881 he was driven out of Texas across the Rio Grande into Mexico by Colonel Grierson, and was virtually annihilated with most of his warriors a few weeks later by Mexican troops.⁷

Jason Betzinez, who knew Victorio quite well, describes the Chief in his autobiography, **I Fought with Geronimo**. Betzinez states:

"Victorio and Nanay, together with forty warriors and some women and children, slipped away from the reservation (1879) and went on the warpath, most of them never to return. I had known both these Chiefs since my earliest childhood. They had fought under Chief Roan Shirt (Mangas Colorado). Victorio, together with Loco, had succeeded to the chieftainship of the Warm Springs Band. In our opinion he stood head and shoulders above several war chiefs such as Mangas, Cochise, and Geronimo who have bigger names with the white people. At the same time of this outbreak both Victorio and Nanay were well along in years, Nanay being quite an old man. But together they caused more fear among the settlers and killed more people in a shorter time than any other Apaches."⁸

4. *Ibid.*, 31, 50, 51 footnote.

5. For a more complete analysis of this type of ethnic classification of the Apache people see Gordon C. Baldwin, **The Warrior Apaches** (Tucson, Arizona, 1965), 21-24.

6. Arthur Woodward, "Sidelights on Fifty Years of Apache Warfare, 1836-1886," *Arizona*, Vol. II, No. 3 (July, 1961), 3-14.

7. J. P. Dunn, Jr., **Massacres of the Mountains** (New York, N.D.), 644.

8. Jason Betzinez with W. S. Nye, **I Fought with Geronimo**. (Harrisburg, Pa., 1959), 50. Jason Betzinez was a Warm Springs Apache who lived with Victorio's people as a boy, and later made several raids with Geronimo. He lived to become an old man and in 1959 published this history of his life.

Betzinez further describes the tragic way in which Victorio met his end:

"They approached their campsite in a box canyon some time in the afternoon, a place where there was a welcome pond of water surrounded by rocks and crevices in the cliffs. The advance party reached this spot undisturbed only to be fired upon by the Mexicans lying in ambush on the surrounding heights. Instead of fleeing as they should have done the Indians made a stand—at the same time the main party closing up, was attacked. Neither party was able to join and reinforce the other. The Indians had no chance of escape. Both groups were surrounded. The firing lasted all afternoon and on into the night. The rear party coming up was unable to cut through to help their comrades hence they were forced to watch the final act of tragedy from a distance. Some time after dark the Apaches had fired all their cartridges. A captive Mexican boy with them slipped away and told the enemy that the Indians were out of ammunition. The Mexicans stealing closer threw dynamite into the pockets and crevices where the Indians had concealed themselves. Soon all had been destroyed. Victorio's death occurred at a place which the Indians call Twin Buttes, (Mexico)." 9-10

After the death of Victorio, the Apache sub-chiefs, still at war south of the Mexican border, looked in vein for a new leader who would match the "great Wolf's" prowess." Victorio had been the last war chief to achieve any cohesion among the various bands of Apaches. The only others who had brought this about had been Mangas Colorado and Cochise. With the possible exception of the leadership during the Cibicu incident, there were to be no more war chiefs in Apacheria capable of uniting the tribes.¹²

With Victorio's passing, hostile Apaches began roving in small scattered bands. Raids into Arizona, New Mexico and Sonora were chiefly efforts of these independent bands. Chiefs such as Nanay, Loco, Chato and Nachite led numerous raids across the parched basins of the Arizona and New Mexico Territories, inflicting death and destruction on Americans and Mexicans in those areas. Retalia-

9. *Ibid.*, 53. Many historians place the location of Victorio's death as being in the Cres Castillos Mountains of Mexico, 125 miles from Galeana. See Paul I. Wellman, *The Indian Wars of the West*, (New York, 1947), 391.
10. For an interesting and informative account of the Victorio War—See William H. Leckie, *The Buffalo Soldiers* (Norman, Okla., 1967), 210-229.
11. These Indians for the most part belonged to the various groups of the Chiricahua division.
12. In 1862, Mangas Colorado united his eastern band of Warm Springs Chiricahuas with the central band of Chiricahuas under Cochise in order to repulse whites from the territory. Together they ambushed in Apache Pass a detachment of California Volunteers making their way East to fight for the Union in the Civil War. The result was the largest battle ever fought between Apaches and Americans in the history of the Southwest. The most complete account of the Battle of Apache Pass can be found in John C. Cremony, *Life Among the Apaches* (New York, 1868), 155-167. Cremony estimates that about 700 Indians were engaged in the battle but this figure is probably a little generous.

tion was quick however. Due to the efforts of American and Mexican armies, the Apaches were driven back again into their strongholds deep in the Sierra Madre Mountains of old Mexico.¹³

Still without a unifying force the Tribesmen searched blindly for someone or something which would give them power, strength and leadership so that the Apache whirlwind could flame across the skies of the Arizona desert and drive the hated "White-eyes" from Apacheria forever. Many warriors had died in the war that they waged upon two nations.

Furthermore, only a few Apache groups remained at war. For the most part, the Western Apaches had been living in peace after their first contact with the whites, or, as in the case of the Tontos groups, had been swept from the Tonto basin and had surrendered to General George Crook by 1873. Generally, they were living at peace, settled on the San Carlos and Fort Apache (White Mountain) Reservations.

The warriors in Mexico realized this. They observed their once powerful and gallant way of life slowly decay. Somewhere a new system of values had to be found to replace the old ones which no longer provided security.

So, following the pattern of all crumbling civilization, the desperate Apaches yearned in their extremity for a code of mysticism and supernatural aid to give them the hope they needed to survive.

Strangely enough this development was embodied in a medicine man of the White Mountain group who declared he had the power to bring the dead to life, if the living would first drive the white man from the country. The man's name was Nock-ay-del-Klinne, and, if only for a brief moment in the perspective of their long and tragic history, many of the kinsmen of Apacheria placed their trust for survival and a return to power in this one man.¹⁴

Nock-ay-del-Klinne was a member of the White Mountain group of the Western Apache division and had been living at peace with his people since childhood.¹⁵ His mother was thought to have been

13. For the account of Old Nana's raid, see Dan L. Trapp, *The Conquest of Apacheria* (Norman, Okla., 1967), 211-216. It is an interesting story of how a band of between 15-40 Apaches were doggedly pursued by more than a thousand soldiers and several hundred civilians. Despite their heroic efforts the pursuers could never catch the rheumatic old Chief of near 80 years of age.

14. Fairfax Downey, *Indian Fighting Army* (New York, 1963), 246. It is interesting to note that Downey points out the fact that the belief in mysticism and supernatural aide of a decaying, desperate people is not only confined to uncivilized cultures. Downey states:

"Nor is this to be confined to savages alone, as witness the visions of British troops in a disastrous battle of the First World War: 'Shining Legions,' 'The Angels of Mons, fighting at their side!'"

Many of us shall surely never forget the desperate turn to the supernatural of the Japanese in World War II when they employed their "death angels of the divine Winds," the dreaded Kamakazi.

15. The White Mountain Apache group generally had been at peace since their first contact with the Whites. It is believed that Chief Hacke-Ldasila established this lasting peace with the white man. Goodwin, *op. cit.*, 39.

a Navajo woman. As a child he was always inclined to be a dreamer; hence he gravitated into being a medicine man. Among the Apaches, a medicine man is one who has a trend for the legends of his people, and who occupies the position of legal advisor and story-teller, as well as physician through his knowledge of the medical properties of native plants and herbs. Nock-ay-del-Klinne was believed to have possessed also certain crude powers of hypnotism. He was said to have been one of the first Scouts enlisted by General Crook in 1872.

In 1871 when he was about twenty-six and already a medicine man of some influence, Nock-ay-del-Klinne was chosen as a member of a small delegation of his tribe to be sent to Washington to see President Grant and the marvels of the East. When he returned home he attempted to relate to his people tales about the fabulous buildings, trains, bridges, etc., he had seen in the East, but soon discovered that his kinsmen completely failed to grasp his tales.¹⁶ While in Washington he was presented with a silver medal about two inches in diameter by President Grant as a souvenir. On the front side of the medal was engraved the portrait of President Grant and the words: "United States of America. Let us have Peace, Liberty, Justice and Equality." On the back side of the medal were the words "On Earth Peace, Goodwill toward men—(1871)." The dies for this medal were engraved by Paguet, who at the time (1871) was assistant engraver in the United States Mint in Philadelphia. Nock-ay-del-Klinne wore this medal as a pendant around his neck when he died.¹⁷

Sometime after his return from Washington, he went to school in Santa Fe, New Mexico, where he absorbed but hardly understood the elements of Christianity. The story of the Resurrection made a deep and lasting impression and is important in that it eventually formed the basis for his philosophies and prophecies which ignited the Cibicu troubles. When he returned to his people, he isolated himself in the wilderness to fast and pray and contemplate religion, especially the withdrawal of Christ for meditation. He became determined to follow that example. As the years passed he counseled the troubled and treated the sick of his people. In 1881 says Thomas Cruse, "he was about thirty-six years old, about five feet six inches tall, very spare and ascetic looking, weighed about one hundred and twenty-five pounds and was very light colored for an Apache. By this time his philosophies had gained a great popularity and Nock-ay-del-Klinne had achieved much influence among his people." John Clum stated that while living on the reservation the medicine man

16. Thomas Cruse, *Cibicu and Fort Apache, 1881. Reminiscences of Major General Thomas Cruse*. An unpublished manuscript made from the original by Will C. Barnes in the Gatewood collection of the Arizona Pioneers' Historical Society, Tucson, 49. (Hereinafter cited as Cruse M.S.) Thomas Cruse was a captain in command of Company A, Indian Scouts, 6th U. S. Cavalry, stationed at Fort Apache in 1881 and participated in the Battle of Cibicu. His autobiography, *Apache Days and After*, (Caldwell, Idaho, 1941) combined with this manuscript offer the most vivid and fairly accurate accounts of the events at Cibicu.
17. Anton Mazzanovich, "The Story of the Medicine Man's Medal," *Winners of the West*, Vol. II, No. 5 (April 1925). Anton Mazzanovich, *Trailing Geronimo*, (Hollywood, Calif., 1931), 20.

became somewhat influenced by the convincing jibberishes of Geronimo.¹⁸ However, he was not yet considered a menace by the Agency authorities or the Army.¹⁹

The first serious actions of the medicine man occurred in June of 1881. In that year he had started a series of revival meetings very similar to our old-fashioned Southern 'camp meetings' that the Negroes held ever so often, wherein the participants worked themselves into the frenzy of 'getting religion' and expressing it vocally and physically with the most sincere belief in its efficacy. Actually, the Apaches attending these dances did very little shouting, but they did dance a new and particular step to the rhythm of tom-toms for hours, even days, until some sort of religious frenzy overcame them and they dropped unconscious from exhaustion.²⁰

About August 1st a very large dance was held on Carizo Creek about eighteen miles from Fort Apache. It was attended by representatives from several of the tribes which formerly and usually were hostile toward each other and had been so for centuries.²¹

It is interesting to note the importance of this particular revival of August 1st. For the first time in many years the various bands of Apaches were finally united behind one universal cause. Indeed, this was the first time in the history of Apacheria that Western Apaches joined forces of consort with Chiricahuas. Perhaps in Nock-ay-del-Klinne there was not simply a leader but an entire code of ethics that would once again unite Apache tribes as their great War Chiefs of the past had done to some extent.

When the word of the Carizo revival reached Fort Apache, Sam Bowman, Chief of Scouts, went to see what was going on. When he returned, he promptly submitted his resignation to Cruse, giving for a reason that he had been in Arizona for six or seven years and that he wanted to return to his people in Oklahoma. His request was accepted and he left the territory. Cruse later learned from Chief Parker Nat Nobles that such dances as were being held at the revivals were always a source of trouble and that he (Bowman) wanted no part of it. John Burnes, a sergeant in the Sixth Cavalry replaced him as Chief of Indian Scouts, Co. A, 6th Cavalry.²²

About this time the Indian Agent, Major Tiffany, a veteran of the Civil War, came up from San Carlos to visit the post. Nock-ay-del-Klinne came to see him and secured the agent's permission to move his meeting place to a large flat on the north Fork of White River, approximately two miles from the post. Tiffany, joined by Cruse, attended the dance held there and were much interested in

18. Woodworth Clum, *Apache Agent* (Boston, 1936), 265.

19. Cruse, *Apache Days*, 94 and Cruse M.S., 49-50.

20. *Ibid.*, 94.

21. Cruse M.S., 50.

22. *Ibid.*, 50-51. Sam Bowman was a noted scout in the Apache Wars and is usually associated with Al Sieber, Mickey Free and Tom Horn. He was part Negro and part Choctaw. Thrapp, *Apacheria*, 218 footnote 8. See also Dan L. Thrapp, *Al Sieber, Chief of Scouts* (Norman, Okla., 1964), 400.

it as they still had no notion of the reasons or the meaning of the rituals; only that perhaps they might be a possible source of trouble. Cruse commented on the mixture of the audience which "included Apaches who had been prosecuted as murderers, horse thieves, women stealers—all these mingled with the best elements of the tribes who only a short time before had been trying to locate and exterminate these same renegades, together with Indians from every tribe on the reservation who, under normal circumstances, hated each other with a deadly aversion."²³

Later, the revivals were moved back to Carizo Creek and then to Cibicu Creek, about forty-five miles from the post. It was then that trouble began to stir. Every one of the scouts at Fort Apache requested passes to attend the dance at Cibicu. The passes were issued but the scouts overstayed them and returned to the post exhausted, without sleep and generally unfit for duty. They did not want to work either. Cruse recalls that most of them seemed to be contemplating some deep thought. The Post Trader refused further credit to a scout who told him contemptuously, "no matter, I will soon have it all anyway."²⁴

It was at this point that governmental action was first taken. Agent Tiffany sent a request to Nock-ay-del-Klinne to come to San Carlos and hold his dances there, but the medicine man promptly and respectfully declined. Tiffany then sent his highly reputable Indian Police to arrest Nock-ay-del-Klinne and bring him to San Carlos. After two or three days they returned, disarmed, disgruntled, and sullen.²⁵ The military authorities during this time, concerned with the tense situation that was mounting, were anxious to take some sort of action but were unable to do so until a request should come from the Indian agent, as no overt act had been committed on the Fort Apache Reservation.

The fact of the matter was that the crucial situation which was arising did not stem from Nock-ay-del-Klinne himself nor from his preachings in essence. Indeed he had always been a peaceful Indian. The bad elements of the tribes as usual were simply taking advantage of the unifying situation which had occurred as a result of the medicine man's philosophies which had now gotten out of his control and threatened to engulf him. These Indians were all grasping for power whether they believed the philosophies or not, and were eager to utilize the situation as a means for starting a war on organized society.²⁶ It was true that many innocent Indians were caught up in the situation and, rendered desperate by their circumstances, fell under the influence of Nock-ay-del-Klinne.²⁷

23. Cruse M.S., 51.

24. *Ibid.*, 51.

25. Cornelius C. Smith, "The Fight at the Cibicu, and Nock-ay-del-Klinne, Apache Medicine Man," *Winners of the West*, Vol. XI (July-August, 1934) 1. This detachment consisted of 20 of the best Indian Police. They were met by 300 of Nock-ay-del-Klinne's adherents before they reached his camp and were there disarmed and ordered to return to San Carlos.

26. Cruse, M. S., 52.

27. Ralph H. Ogle, *Federal Control of the Western Apaches: 1848-1886* (Albuquerque, 1940), 104.

Finally "Nock-ay-del-Klinne performed a coup that brought him even greater power and influence than he had possessed—but also brought about his downfall."²⁸ After a typical frenzied dance, one of the medicine man's fanatic followers faced Nock-ay-del-Klinne and made a new demand. "It is known to us," the Indian cried, "that those of our people who have died are still living, but only invisible. If you are the great one we believe you to be, go call to those of our great leaders who have died. Ask them to help us, their people. Ask them to tell us what we shall do now about our country and the whites who rule it." This demand was probably made by a delegation of the war-hungry elements on the reservation. Anyhow, a request of this nature could not be refused.

Nock-ay-del-Klinne, along with three of his disciples ascended a high mesa above Cibicu and fasted and meditated for many hours, making appeals to the great ones to rise from the dead and appear. "Come to us" they prayed. "Show yourselves to us again. Tell us your people what we must do." Then three of their dead chiefs supposedly did actually rise out of the ground slowly coming up no farther than their knees. They looked all about them and then said:

"Why do you call upon us? Why do you disturb us? We do not wish to come back. The buffalo are gone. White people are everywhere in the land that was ours. We do not wish to come back."

Nock-ay-del-Klinne and his companions then said: "But tell us what we must do." The spirits answered them: "Live at peace with the white man and let us rest."²⁹ Then they began to sink into the ground and became shadows.

This experience was told to Cruse several years later by one of the witnesses with Nock-ay-del-Klinne on the mesa. He swore he saw the three chiefs rise from the ground, take solid form and speak these words. But he admits that he was very weak from fasting, exhausted from much dancing, and the whole experience seemed very much like a dream.

However, when the witnesses made their report to the rest of the Apaches there was nothing dreamlike about the effect. Each faction among the Indians interpreted the visions to suit themselves. None doubted the appearance of the three dead chiefs. To most of them it was an assurance that the dead lived on, invisibly, and that a future life did in truth, exist.

"To the warring factions who had been preaching extermination of the whites, the vision was a solemn injunction," says Cruse, "to clear the Apache Country of the enemy. To no more than a handful was it a command to remain at peace."³⁰ Naturally, it was the war faction that aroused the interest of the military at Fort Apache.

28. Cruse, *Apache Days*, 97.

29. *Ibid.*, 98.

30. *Ibid.*, 97-99.

After the first report of the vision, various stories began to spread among all the Indians on the reservation, no doubt the propaganda work of the malcontents. One version had it that the medicine man would bring the dead to life after which the White Mountain people would meet in the Tonto basin to wipe the hated pale-face from the land.³¹ Another version stated that the medicine man could not bring the dead to life because of the presence of the white people; that when the white people left, the dead would return, and the whites would be out of the country when the corn was ripe, and there would be a return to prosperous times.³²

This last version probably came about when Nock-ay-del-Klinne did not in fact bring anybody back to life in order to repopulate the Apache's war effort.

Among other things, it was said that the medicine man had a "ghost shirt" through which no white man's bullet could pass. He was supposed to have worn the shirt at the dances and to have asserted that he was safe from any attack that might be made upon him.³³ Furthermore, it was thought that any Indian who followed Nock-ay-del-Klinne and his cause would, likewise, be done no harm by the white man's bullets.³⁴

It is interesting to note at this point how the philosophies of Nock-ay-del-Klinne closely parallel the "ghost dance" craze that swept the reservations of the Plains Indians after 1888. James Mooney, one of the most famous ethnologists of the Nineteenth Century, in his book *The Ghost Dance Religion and the Sioux Outbreak of 1890* gives a definition of this philosophy. Mooney states:

"The great underlying principle of the Ghost Dance doctrine is that the time will come when the whole Indian race, living and dead, will be reunited upon a regenerated earth, to live a life of aboriginal happiness, forever free from death, disease, and misery. The White race, being alien and secondary and hardly real, has no part in this scheme of aboriginal regeneration, and will be left behind with the other things of earth that have served their temporary purpose, or else will cease entirely to exist."³⁵

Mooney goes on to assert that:

"Of the tribes southward from the Paiute, according to the best information obtainable, the Ghost Dance never reached the Yuma, Pima, Papago, Maricopa, or any of the Apache bands in Arizona or New Mexico. It is said that six Apaches attended the first large dance at Walker Lake in 1889. This seems im-

31. Mazzanovich, "Medicine Man's Medal," 1.

32. Frank C. Lockwood, *The Apache Indians* (New York, 1938), 236.

33. Will C. Barnes, *Apaches and Longhorns* (Los Angeles, 1941), 52.

34. Cornelius C. Smith, "The Fight at Cibicu," *Arizona Highways*, Vol. XXXII, No. 5 (May, 1956), 2.

35. James Mooney, *The Ghost Dance Religion and the Sioux Outbreak of 1890*, (Chicago, 1965), 19.

probable, but if true it produced no effect on any part of the tribe at large."³⁶

The term Ghost Dance was not in use in 1881; indeed if Mooney is correct in his assertion that the first large dance was held in 1889 it seems improbable that the movement had even begun to any great extent at the time of Cibicu. However, if Mooney is correct in stating that the Apache never practiced the Ghost Dance, in the same manner that the Plains Tribes did, at least, he is surely overlooking Nock-ay-del-Klinne's movement. Perhaps it is fact that the ceremonial aspect of the dance differed between the Apaches at Cibicu and the Plains Tribes, possibly due to their different cultures. It is also probable that the Apache movement and the Plains Tribes movement had completely different origins. But, never-the-less, if the statement made by Mooney is to state the **underlying principle** as to what the Ghost Dance advocated, it seems quite clear that the Apache movement correlates precisely and in this case may be classified generally, as a "Ghost Dance." At any rate, like the Sioux a few years later, the Apaches would not place their hopes in the unearthly.

Meanwhile, the situation at Fort Apache and San Carlos was worsening. After the rumors of regeneration of the dead were spread, Nock-ay-del-Klinne began to stir the Apaches into even a wilder frenzy and a more fierce attitude towards the whites than ever before. The Indian scouts at Fort Apache were harder to handle and shrugged their duties. Mutterings were heard around the post from the Indians that if the whites did not get out of the Apache country they would be driven out. At San Carlos when Agent Tiffany refused to give any more passes to the Indians to go to Cibicu, hundreds of them went anyway without permission. When the Apache Police were ordered to stop them the police reported themselves helpless.

The situation had mushroomed to such an extent by this time that the civilian Indian Bureau could no longer control it. Therefore at long last the military at Fort Apache was requested by Agent Tiffany to intervene.³⁷

Fort Apache was the regimental headquarters of the Sixth United States Cavalry. The regimental commander was Colonel Eugene Asa Carr. Colonel Carr was an officer of long distinguished service in the army and he had a most gallant record in combat since the Civil War. He was born in New York and graduated from the United States Military Academy in 1850. Between 1850 and 1861 he served as Colonel of the Third Illinois Cavalry. In 1862 he was decorated for conspicuous bravery at the Battle of Pea Ridge and in that same year, was appointed brigadier-general of Volunteers in command of the Thirteenth Army Corps during the Vicksburg Campaign of 1863. After the Civil War he participated in campaigns against the Plains Indians in Kansas, Nebraska, and Colorado. In

36. *Ibid.*, 49.

37. Cruse, *Apache Days*, 99.

1873 he was promoted to Lieutenant Colonel and given command of the Fourth Cavalry. Later he replaced Lieutenant-Colonel J. P. Hatch, as commander of the Fifth Cavalry, stationed at Camp Lowell, Tucson, Arizona until 1874. Eventually he was given command of the Sixth Cavalry and moved to Fort Apache. He was there scarcely five weeks when the trouble with Nock-ay-del-Klinne was brought to his attention.³⁸

Carr's immediate superior and commanding officer was General Orlando B. Willcox, Commander of the Department of Arizona, with headquarters at Whipple Barracks, Arizona.³⁹

General Irwin McDowell was in command of the Division of the Pacific which encompassed the Departments of Arizona and New Mexico. However, the local situation of the Cibicu trouble for the time being concerned only the immediate authorities which included Carr, Willcox, and Agent Tiffany.

Colonel Carr first heard of the dances through an interpreter, Pvt. Charles Hurle of Company D. He informed Carr that Nock-ay-del-Klinne had been holding dances near Cibicu Creek in order to raise the spirits of dead warriors. Carr didn't think much of the matter at the time, nor did he believe the situation to be serious when he was later informed by Hurle as to the reason the dead spirits were to be raised. Nevertheless he thought department headquarters should know of the situation and he sent a telegram to General Willcox on August 1. However, the department headquarters did not receive the message until the 5th of August because the telegraph wire was out of order. Carr's telegram read as follows:

"It is now reported to me by interpreter Hurle that Nock-ay-del-Klinne is telling the Indians that the dead say they will not return because of the presence of white people—that when the white people leave, the dead will return and that the whites will be out of the country when the corn gets ripe. Hurle thinks his next move may be to induce the Indians to hasten the departure of the whites, and that he may be working them up to a frame of mind suitable for the purpose—I do not know whether all this is of any consequence, but feel it my duty to report it to the department commander."⁴⁰

When General Willcox received the telegram, he answered it immediately stating to "watch the matter closely, and take steps necessary to prevent trouble. Communicate with Agent (Tiffany) at San Carlos."⁴¹ It is not clear just what Willcox meant by "necessary steps" but Carr guessed correctly that it might involve Nock-ay-del-Klinne's arrest.

38. Ezra J. Warner, *Generals In Blue*, (Louisiana State University Press, 1964), 70-71.

39. Mazzanovich, *Trailing Geronimo*, 120.

40. National Archives, Record Group 98, Letters Received, Department of Arizona. Telegram dated Fort Apache, August 1, 1861.

41. *Ibid.*, Telegram dated Whipple Barracks, Prescott, August 6, 1881.

1873 he was promoted to Lieutenant Colonel and given command of the Fourth Cavalry. Later he replaced Lieutenant-Colonel J. P. Hatch, as commander of the Fifth Cavalry, stationed at Camp Lowell, Tucson, Arizona until 1874. Eventually he was given command of the Sixth Cavalry and moved to Fort Apache. He was there scarcely five weeks when the trouble with Nock-ay-del-Klinne was brought to his attention.³⁸

Carr's immediate superior and commanding officer was General Orlando B. Willcox, Commander of the Department of Arizona, with headquarters at Whipple Barracks, Arizona.³⁹

General Irwin McDowell was in command of the Division of the Pacific which encompassed the Departments of Arizona and New Mexico. However, the local situation of the Cibicu trouble for the time being concerned only the immediate authorities which included Carr, Willcox, and Agent Tiffany.

Colonel Carr first heard of the dances through an interpreter, Pvt. Charles Hurle of Company D. He informed Carr that Nock-ay-del-Klinne had been holding dances near Cibicu Creek in order to raise the spirits of dead warriors. Carr didn't think much of the matter at the time, nor did he believe the situation to be serious when he was later informed by Hurle as to the reason the dead spirits were to be raised. Nevertheless he thought department headquarters should know of the situation and he sent a telegram to General Willcox on August 1. However, the department headquarters did not receive the message until the 5th of August because the telegraph wire was out of order. Carr's telegram read as follows:

"It is now reported to me by interpreter Hurle that Nock-ay-del-Klinne is telling the Indians that the dead say they will not return because of the presence of white people—that when the white people leave, the dead will return and that the whites will be out of the country when the corn gets ripe. Hurle thinks his next move may be to induce the Indians to hasten the departure of the whites, and that he may be working them up to a frame of mind suitable for the purpose—I do not know whether all this is of any consequence, but feel it my duty to report it to the department commander."⁴⁰

When General Willcox received the telegram, he answered it immediately stating to "watch the matter closely, and take steps necessary to prevent trouble. Communicate with Agent (Tiffany) at San Carlos."⁴¹ It is not clear just what Willcox meant by "necessary steps" but Carr guessed correctly that it might involve Nock-ay-del-Klinne's arrest.

38. Ezra J. Warner, *Generals In Blue*, (Louisiana State University Press, 1964), 70-71.

39. Mazzanovich, *Trailing Geronimo*, 120.

40. National Archives, Record Group 98, Letters Received, Department of Arizona. Telegram dated Fort Apache, August 1, 1861.

41. *Ibid.*, Telegram dated Whipple Barracks, Prescott, August 6, 1881.

Carr contacted Tiffany on August 10th and told him that in his opinion, the medicine man's activities were not particularly dangerous even though it might be desirable to make the arrest. Carr stated "I would not like to take the responsibility (for the arrest) as it might precipitate a war."⁴²

Tiffany, however, did not agree with Carr. True, he may have believed that the situation was a definite threat to peace. But on the other hand he was engaged in corrupt activities which were revealed after his resignation, and perhaps he wished to avoid public scrutiny of his dealings at San Carlos. Therefore he requested Carr to send him regular reports of the medicine man's activities, and telegraphed General Willcox to request a shipment of arms and ammunition.⁴³

In obedience to Tiffany's request Carr sent another report to San Carlos.

"Pvt. Hurlle says Indian Doctor puts food in Medicine lodge and pretends that the dead come and eat it. Says that the Indians think this Doctor will be the head of all the Indians, that he says the ground will turn over, the dead will rise and the Indians be above the whites; that they will have possession of this Post."⁴⁴

Agent Tiffany answered the request by August 13, stating that it was unsafe to let the matter run its course. General Hatch, the commander of the Department of New Mexico, meanwhile reported to Tiffany that a band of hostile Apache was moving west toward Arizona and Tiffany believed it was time to stop the troubles.

On the same day, Carr received the following orders from Department headquarters:

"The commanding General directs that you arrest the Chief and Medicine Man, if you deem it necessary, to prevent trouble, after consultation with the agent at San Carlos."⁴⁵

Carr protested once again to Tiffany that the arrest might provoke violent hostilities, and requested a clarification of orders from the Agency. On August 15, Carr received the clarified statement from Tiffany:

"I want him arrested or killed, or both and think it had better be before dance next Saturday night."⁴⁶

Also on the 15th, a confirmation of Tiffany's orders came in from Willcox:

"The commanding General desires that you arrest the Indian doctor, who you report as stirring up hostilities, as soon as possible."⁴⁷

Soon after its receipt the telegraph line was once again cut by the Apaches. The break was discovered near Fort Thomas. By August 23 it was repaired and Carr answered his orders:

42. *Ibid.*, Telegram dated Fort Apache, August 10, 1881.

43. Cruse, *Apache Days*. 99.

44. N. A., R. G. 98—Report from Carr dated August 10, 1881.

45. *Ibid.*, Dispatch dated Prescott, August 7, 1881. Carr received the order at Fort Apache on August 13.

46. *Ibid.*, Telegram dated San Carlos, August 14, 1881.

47. *Ibid.*, Telegram dated Prescott, August 14, 1881.

"I wish it to be observed that I did not 'report' the Indian doctor 'as stirring up hostilities,' see your telegram of the 13th ordering his arrest, but merely the reported statements and the inference of the Interpreter to the Department commander for what they might be worth."⁴⁸

Carr was still convinced that Nock-ay-del-Klinne's activities were not dangerous, and that only trouble would follow if the medicine man were arrested. Nevertheless, he now had specific orders from his superior officer. He reluctantly resolved himself to the burdensome task of deciding how to carry them out.

August 20 was the deadline Tiffany had proposed to Carr. Nock-ay-del-Klinne was planning another dance that night and the general believed action should be taken before this occurred. He devised a plan by which he would attempt to coax the medicine man into the post just before the dance and make the arrest there. This show of military force must cause no more alarm than need be among the Indians.⁴⁹

On August 20, before initiating his plan, Carr called Lieutenant Cruse into his office and questioned him about the Apache scouts' loyalty in view of the situation. The general told Cruse that he had heard nasty rumors about them and Cruse told him quite frankly that if an outbreak came from the medicine man's meetings, he expected trouble. "I think my scouts want to be loyal," Cruse said, "but if it comes to a showdown I don't see how they can side with us. Their families are all with Nock-ay-del-Klinne and they will probably be swept off their feet and go along." General Carr replied, "But the scouts have always been loyal! They have obeyed orders under the most adverse conditions, even shooting some of their relations when occasion demanded it."⁵⁰ Cruse admitted this but reminded the General that none of the usual conditions were present in this situation and that they were facing Indians roused as they had never seen them due to the regilious implications of Nock-ay-del-Klinne's preachings.

Upon hearing Cruse's opinion of the matter, Carr asked him if he could suggest a plan. Cruse replied:

"My suggestion would be that you order me and my scouts to proceed at once to (Fort) Huachuca. We can go by the Stevens Ranch and Solomonsville and avoid the (San Carlos) Agency. I suggest that you order Lieutenant Mills and his Company C of Scouts to come at once to Fort Apache in our place. C is a mixed company—Mojaves, Yumas, and a scattering of Chiricahuas. They have no such interest in conditions here as my scouts have."⁵¹

After Cruse's suggestion, Carr sent for interpreter Hurle and received almost an identical opinion from him. Hurle added that al-

48. *Ibid.*, Telegram dated Fort Apache, August 23, 1881.

49. Cruse, *Apache Days*, 102-103.

50. *Ibid.*, 100.

51. *Ibid.*

though the medicine man himself was not planning an outbreak, he was sure that certain "bad-men" among the Apaches were planning an uprising.

After dismissing Cruse and Hurle, Carr sent a telegram to General Willcox requesting the changes they suggested. In addition he requested that two troops of Cavalry be sent on force march from Fort Grant to Fort Apache. Just after the message was sent the telegraph line went down again and was not repaired until a week later.⁵²

Meanwhile, Carr's orders kept confidential until this time had leaked out. Some of the soldiers had been using the information to taunt the Apaches.

About this time an old Apache chief, Not-chi-clish, came into the post and asked to talk to Carr. Speaking through interpreter Hurle, he told the Colonel that he was the white man's friend and that he (Carr) should not listen to idle talk about the Indians. He stated that he would keep the military aware of what was happening. This of course provided evidence that the Indians had been talking to enlisted men and had reported the conversations to their comrades.

Meanwhile, Nock-ay-del-Klinne had apparently been informed of several of the false rumors and therefore sent a refusal to Carr's invitation to come to the Fort. He gave for a reason that he had been forced to cancel his Dance Saturday night, August 20, in order to go on a hunt. Furthermore, he said that many of his people were sick and needed his help. However, another Dance was scheduled for August 27 and he might come in at that time. August 27 came but no medicine man appeared at the Fort. On August 28 he sent word to Carr that he would not come to the fort.⁵³

Carr, was now backed against the wall. Agent Tiffany's deadline of August 20th had long since passed. His orders from Willcox were precise and needed no further clarification. He still believed that the medicine man's activities were not dangerous, although he had greatly underestimated his influence over the Indians. On the other hand two companies from Fort Thomas were due, and their appearance at Fort Apache might overawe the Indians while he carried out the arrest order.

The arrest order in itself was either an oversight or the mere lack of responsibility on the part of Willcox because the medicine man had, in truth, brought no one back to life. The ideal solution would have been to tell the Indians their Nock-ay-del-Klinne was a false prophet and then let Carr prove it. The order from Willcox only gave the Indians greater confidence in the medicine man by making them think that the whites were afraid of his powers. Carr knew this and had been trying to avoid or at least hide from the Indians any circumstance that would arouse this sort of feeling

52. *Ibid.*, 101.

53. James T. King, *War Eagle* (Lincoln, Nebraska, 1963), 202

among them. But he had failed to coax the medicine man into the Fort. He had attempted a bluff and lost. There was no small risk involved and the orders had to be carried out. Carr knew he must act now. He would go down to Cibicu Creek and arrest Nock-ay-del-Klinne.

The result was the bloody battle of Cibicu.

THE SALADO CULTURE IN COCHISE COUNTY

by Jack P. and Vera M. Mills

Cochise County has been the home of many people in the past, some of which date back thousands of years ago.

We have worked with one of these ancient cultures for 19 years and since this article is for the Cochise Quarterly, it seems appropriate to talk about a people who lived here. They also lived in other parts of Arizona and in New Mexico. These people are known to archaeologists as the Salado Culture.

Their economy was mainly agricultural, so they lived in permanent type, above ground, houses, always in settlements or villages.

They raised crops of corn, beans, cotton and squash in nearby fields and, perhaps difficult to believe today, their crops were raised by natural rainfall.

Needless to say, in order for them to do this, there was more rainfall then, moreover the water table was only 5 feet below surface.

We know these things because we excavated a walk-in well, which was 5 feet deep at the lowest point and gradually sloped up all around so that the habitants could walk in and fill their water jars at the rocky bottom.

Also, we have numerous aerial photographs of the excavations and none of these show traces of ancient irrigation canals.

As previously mentioned, this culture was not confined to this county, in fact the precise extent of their boundary is, not yet, fully known. Certainly their influence, if not their habitations, extended over a wide area.

We have excavated three Salado sites in Cochise County, one in Central Arizona, in the Tonto Basin, Gila County, and one in western New Mexico. In all of these areas, there are many more sites which are also Salado.

We have also excavated a Babacomari village in this county where the trade wares were made by the Salado people, and a site near the international border where the pottery types were almost 50% Salado and 50% Mexican wares.

We have found the study of this ancient culture a most interesting and absorbing subject. We have learned many things about these people but there is so much more to be learned we sometimes wonder if we do not end each "dig" with as many unanswered questions as those which are answered.

Although these people were, primarily, farmers, they sometimes supplemented this by a deer or rabbit hunt, and there was a limited amount of gathering of native plants or seeds such as black walnuts, wild gourds, (curcubita) mesquite beans, etc. These are things of which we have actual proof. There is little doubt but that many things were used of which it would be impossible to find remains.

These were a resourceful people. For building material they utilized whatever was at hand. In this county they built of adobe. They did not form bricks in molds as we do today but, instead, laid up their walls of large chunks of adobe in layers 18 to 20 inches high. When one layer was completed and dry, another layer was placed on top and so on until the wall reached the desired height.

Here, in the valley, the houses were one story only. We have found, at various times, walls which had fallen outward but had not broken apart thereby making it possible to get a near idea of the height of the walls, 7½ to 8 feet. Roof structures were placed on top adding a few more inches to the inside dimension.

The roofs were flat and many of the household chores were carried on in the open, either in the courtyards or on the rooftops. In some instances a shade was erected over the work area. The houses were built in such a manner as to enclose a courtyard or large open patio. We have found fire pits and floored work areas in the courtyards.

Their houses had no windows or doors, entrance was gained by means of ladders through a hatchway in the roof. These hatchways served a dual purpose—they were also an outlet for smoke when the intramural fire pit was in use.

It is not always possible to find the hatchway when excavating since it is sometimes broken up when roof collapsed, but in all cases where we have found evidence of it, it has always been near the fire-pit.

There was a way of closing this hatchway if weather was bad enough to make it necessary. In this area the coverings were of woven straw or grass matting. Naturally we find only charred remains of such a covering, and this type of evidence requires careful excavation.

In central Arizona, the hatch covers were made of flat, thin stones, carefully chipped all around. They were rounded in shape.

In Western New Mexico, we found remains of a wood hatch cover, still in place in the hatchway.

As we have said, these people utilized whatever was at hand. In areas where building stone was available, they built their houses of stone and did some exceptionally good work.

Stone structures were usually more than one story high. In Western New Mexico the houses were of two story height while in Central Arizona the house we excavated was four stories high.

Houses of this height required walls strong enough to support the added stress and some of the walls were 3 feet thick and many were 2 feet in thickness.

Rooms were plastered on the inside with mud plaster and the floors were smooth and hard, even though both floors and plaster were of mud. This type of house construction would be warm in winter and cool in summer.

True, the lighting would not be up to our standards, which may account for much of the work being done outside.

These were a stone age people. The only metal they knew was in the form of small copper bells which were traded in from Mexico and which were highly prized as ornaments.

These people loved beauty and color, as evidenced by their excellent and beautifully painted ceramics. They also loved personal adornment. They had jewelry made from clay, (beads) stone, (beads and pendants) shells, (beads, pendants, rings, ear ornaments and bracelets). Shell was obtained from the west coast of Mexico, either by barter or by runners.

Turquoise was highly prized and was mined by pre-historic people. They worked it into beads, pendants and inlay pieces which were used for mosaic work on a background of shell or wood.

The late Dr. Cummings tells of how holes were drilled in turquoise by using cactus spines dipped in an abrasive powder.

Serpentine was also made into beads, both disc type and tubular style.

These people smoked pipes but, as yet, no one has found evidence of what was used in the pipes. There are several possibilities—herbs or wild tobacco for instance. Probably this smoking was done during ceremonies.

Some of the things accomplished by these people, without the means of metal tools, are almost unbelievable.

As artists they were superb. The designs on their pottery attest to this.

Some of the paintings may be a supplication for rain or a good growing season, and therefore a good food supply but, we suspect, that many of the designs are the outlet for their artistic ability.

No two designs are alike—each piece is an original. The idea for the painting was carried in the head of the artist.

Stone working was another skill in which they were proficient. They chipped obsidian and chalcedony into beautiful arrowheads, knives, drills and hammer stones. Axes were also made from stone as were, also, metates, manos, mortars and pestles.

Deer bone was worked into tools for various purposes.

They were proficient at spinning and weaving and, surprising as it may seem, there was some especially fine weaving produced in prehistoric times, made entirely on wooden looms.

We find few specimens of weaving since we work in open sites, but some excellent examples have been found by archaeologists working in caves where perishable materials are protected. We do, however, find the indestructable parts of the spinning and weaving equipment giving adequate proof that this trade was carried on in this area and, by the way, the spinning and weaving was done by the men while the women made and painted the pottery.

There is little we can tell of the religious beliefs of these people—we know only that they believed in a life after death, that they held all natural things in high regard and that they believed all things were animals.

Natural concretions were highly prized, in fact it would seem that they were considered as having supernatural powers. We can arrive at conclusions of this type when finds are made in certain associations often enough to have significance.

It is quite likely that certain individuals were skilled in certain trades and that these skilled artisans were held in high respect by other members of the village. Objects made by such skilled craftsmen, or women, were highly prized and sought after.

For instance some men were skilled in lapidary work while others were expert at stone work.

Certain women were talented artists and pottery pieces, made by these skilled workers, were sought by those wanting distinctive pieces.

The gradual gathering of data, such as these, is a slow and painstaking process but one which lends much satisfaction and it makes the work intensely interesting.

As this culture became more prolific and more virulent, its influence spread in ever widening circles, but always, their integration with other peoples, was accomplished peacefully. They mingled with these new cultures, in a harmonious way, collecting traits from their new neighbors, while at the same time, dispersing ideas of their own which were adopted by their new friends, much as the Saladoans were, themselves, accepted.

This lent a new impetus to some of the older cultures, and, as always happens, resulted in a new way of life. But this was not to last. New changes were again under way, changes which eventually destroyed these people and where the remaining remnant went or what happened to them is still not known but new data are constantly being brought to light, new sites discovered and new methods discovered. As new evidence gradually accumulates and is added to what we have already learned in past studies, we shall know more of what happened to the people who lived here long ago.